Mystery in the Mansion

Ramapo College of New Jersey is home to a Gilded Age mystery. On July 13, 1900, Nathalie "Lillie" Mayer shot herself in the Birch Mansion, the building now known as the office of the college president. Students and school employees claim her ghost haunts their campus.

SCOTT YUNKER JR. | April 3, 2019
Ghost Stories
An investigation into the genesis of a New Jersey ghost story has shone new light on a 19th-century mystery involving money, a rumored affair, a family curse and an untimely death that took place on what is now the campus of Ramapo College of New Jersey.

The school is located in the town of Mahwah at the base of the Ramapo Mountains, approximately two miles from the New York border. Its campus is surrounded by forest and farmland, giving visitors a false sense of relative isolation (midtown Manhattan is a mere 24 miles away).

Ramapo College is the smallest public college in its state, with a total enrollment of 6,174 as of fall 2018. It’s also a relatively young institution: It will celebrate the 50th anniversary of its founding in November 2019, and some faculty present during the college’s early years still teach at the school. It is a place seemingly absent of history; the glass-walled wings of its central academic complex are of a bare, modern design that seems to belie all that has come before.

---

A 19TH-CENTURY MYSTERY INVOLVING MONEY, A RUMORED AFFAIR, A FAMILY CURSE AND AN UNTIMELY DEATH.

---

The Birch Mansion stands at the center of campus as the college’s chief administrative building (college President Peter Mercer’s office is located there) and the grandest reminder of the 300-acre property’s past. Construction was completed in 1890 on what was then Mountain Side Farm, the second home of Theodore Augustus Havemeyer, a wealthy Manhattanite whose family made its fortune in the sugar industry. He built the two-storied red brick home as a wedding present to his oldest daughter, Nathalie “Lillie” Ida Blanche Havemeyer Mayer, who had married a local workman named John Mayer a few years prior. Lillie would call the mansion home for the entirety of her short life. On Friday, July 13, 1900, the 36-year-old was found on the floor of her second-story bedroom with a bullet wound in her chest. She died the following evening. Her death – claimed accidental by the surviving family at the time – would be the latest in a series of tragic events to befall the Havemeyer clan. A ghost story was born.

When first-year students are nudged by upperclassmen and told the mansion is haunted, it is easy to dismiss the ghost story as a tall tale made of whole cloth. But Lillie’s ghost is more real than that. It is a scar, a trace remainder of real history cloaked in fantasy. It is all that remains in the popular consciousness of an actual event. The repeated claims of her ghost’s presence in the mansion are not proof of the supernatural. They are threads spooling forward in time, connected to a forgotten tragedy. Tug one and you’ll soon discover the brief life and mysterious death of Lillie Havemeyer Mayer.
THE PAST

Newspapers cast Lillie as a victim of the so-called Havemeyer Curse, karmic payback for her family’s allegedly ill-gotten wealth. Within days of her death, Lillie’s longtime friend and secretary Clifton H. Paige left the mansion, according to newspaper accounts published at the time. The press implied he had been Lillie’s lover, in an era when many newspapers thrived on gossip and sensationalism. Two days after Lillie’s death, *The Evening World* published a front-page story replete with hearsay regarding Lillie and Paige’s relationship.

*Click [HERE](#) to explore a timeline of the Havemeyer Curse.*
WITHIN DAYS OF HER DEATH, LILLIE'S LONGTIME FRIEND AND SECRETARY CLIFTON H. PAIGE LEFT THE MANSION.

“At home he was frequently seen driving with Mrs. Mayer,” reads the article. “The country people noticed that when Mrs. Mayer appeared in a new riding costume Mr. Paige often wore a riding suit of the same material.” Lillie’s story shared page space with items titled “Knife Used in Fight” and “Rita Riley Near Death – Young Actress Saved from Waves at Brighton Beach.” This latter piece was accompanied by a rather salacious illustration of Ms. Riley in a slinky gown, her fingers running through her crown of curly hair. *The Evening World* chose to titillate its readership rather than appeal to a sense of sobriety.

Paige’s apparent flight from Mountain Side Farm seems to lend credence to the theories floated by the media at the time. An examination of newspaper archives and documents conducted for this story has been unable to confirm the veracity of these rumors but has succeeded in revealing previously unknown information regarding Paige’s life in the years before and after his 10-year stint at Mountain Side Farm.

2 - A building project on Mountain Side Farm. Courtesy of the Mahwah Museum

THE PRESENT

Ghost stories are ubiquitous. Traditions of spirits both benign and vindictive may be found the world over. The tropes are almost cozy in their familiarity. Through popular culture and literature, we have all heard rattling chains and seen transparent figures walk through walls. We have even participated in our own ghost stories, chanting “Bloody Mary” in bathroom mirrors as children and fearfully awaiting the arrival of a spectral reflection. Ghost stories are Gothic cocktails, intoxicating blends of the romantic and the macabre that offer hope of a life beyond death.

Most ghost stories place emphasis upon location. After all, most ghosts are not itinerant: They linger in one place and haunt it. Lillie’s spirit is apparently one such ghost. The stories told by students and those who work in the Birch Mansion almost always place Lillie on the second floor of the building. This jibes with the circumstances of her death.
On-campus interest in Ramapo College’s ghost story appears to rise and fall throughout the years like an irregular tide. In 2010, an article written in the school’s student publication The Ramapo News reviewed alleged sightings of the ghost and referenced a 2009 student sleepover in the Birch Mansion (which failed to produce evidence of supernatural activity). The story delivers a brief sketch of the historical Lillie’s death but is more concerned with the subsequent folklore, documenting a series of alleged sightings and phenomena.

“A butler’s bell is said to summon the ghost of the late Lillian Mayer (sic) to haunt the person who dares to press it,” the article reads. It also claims a second-story window as the ghost’s favorite haunt. One student is quoted as saying, “When I came on my college tour, I was told by my tour guide if you look back at the top window, you’re able to see her face.”

A short video published on Ramapo College’s YouTube account in 2014 features interviews with two Birch Mansion employees who claim to have interacted with the specter. One is Brittany Williams-Goldstein, who serves on the president’s cabinet as chief of staff. The other is Joan Capizzi, secretary to the provost.

On camera, Williams-Goldstein claims to “have sensed another presence” while working in the mansion during “evening hours.” She recalls “hauling” through the darkened mansion on one occasion, pursued by a cold and unwelcoming shadow. Capizzi’s experience, as told in the video, was markedly different. She describes a benign woman in white. “I saw her at the very end of the hallway,” Capizzi says on camera. “It seemed as if she turned around and looked at me…I felt very peaceful, very calm.” The ghost then nodded and moved toward the attic, disappearing. The video itself ends with its hammy host promising viewers “there are many more who were too afraid to reveal their experiences on camera.”
Lillie Havemeyer Mayer is a minor figure in the grand scheme of her family’s story, having played no part in the production or dissolution of the Havemeyer family fortune. Her father Theodore and uncle Henry Osborne Havemeyer were arguably responsible for both, having turned the already-successful, Brooklyn-based family sugar refinery into a monolith of U.S. business known as the American Sugar Refining Company or “sugar trust.” The brothers were savvy and aggressive businessmen who were not above breaking the law to further their interests: Government officials discovered an “artful scheme by which for years the trust had been systematically cheating the government out of revenue by means of ‘rigged’ scales” in November 1907, according to an article published by The Carroll Herald in 1911. When they died (Theodore in 1897 and Henry in 1907) their families’ wealth soon evaporated, as did the so-called sugar trust.

Tom Dunn, a former Ramapo College trustee and president of the Mahwah Historical Society, is fascinated by Mountain Side Farm. In this interview, he discusses his interest in Theodore A. Havemeyer and shares his take on Lillie Mayer’s death.

Embed://<iframe width="100%" height="300" scrolling="no" frameborder="no" allow="autoplay" src="https://w.soundcloud.com/player/?url=https%3A//api.soundcloud.com/tracks/597764934&color=%23ff5500&auto_play=false&hide_related=false&show_comments=true&show_user=true&show_reposts=false&show_teaser=true&visual=true"></iframe>
Lillie was reportedly reclusive and appears to have removed herself from the Manhattan social scene her family name granted access to. Nor was she a proponent of public causes, unlike her aunt Louisine Havemeyer, a noted feminist and patron of the arts. Lillie instead preferred the calm of Mountain Side Farm to the hustle-bustle of New York, spending her days hunting, horseback riding and enjoying “all outdoor sports.” Little evidence remains of this somewhat hermetic lifestyle. The extent of her education – if any – is unknown, as is her mental state in the days, weeks and years prior to her death in 1900. Her family relationships are likewise unclear. Lillie did, however, exercise great influence over the early life of a young man unrelated to the Havemeyers – the “captain of American industry” Stephen Birch.
LILLIE REMOVED HERSELF FROM THE MANHATTAN SOCIAL SCENE.

Originally from Brooklyn, Birch moved to Mahwah at the age of 10, becoming the frequent playmate of Lillie’s children. He grew up to become an important figure in the history of 20th-century Alaska, his power built on copper mines set deep in the Alaskan wilderness. He owed his success in part to Lillie, who, the Birch biography *Ghosts of Kennecott* indicates, “took a special interest in young Stephen, providing financial assistance for his education at Trinity School, New York University, and Columbia School of Mines.” Seventeen years after Lillie’s death, Birch would buy Mountain Side Farm from his benefactor’s surviving family. The death of his son, Stephen Birch Jr., precipitated the estate’s sale to the founders of Ramapo College in 1970 (the college’s originators founded the school in 1969, without any land on which to build their new venture).

SHE FREQUENTLY VACATIONED WITH HER FAMILY AND SECRETARY MR. PAIGE.

When not at home in Mahwah, Lillie was likely in Europe, where she frequently vacationed with her immediate family and secretary Clifton Paige. Her last trip abroad concluded about three weeks prior to her death, during which time she gave birth to her youngest child, a boy named Joseph, in Rome. She also made her will on that same excursion while in Paris, France. The impetus behind her decision to do so is unknown. Some reports suggest she fell ill after the birth of Joseph, but this claim is refuted in other newspapers’ coverage of Lillie’s death. In 1900 *The New York Times* covered the will’s entrance into probate, reporting Lillie’s “first special bequest” left $10,000 to Paige “if he survives me” (approximately $256,850 today). She left $500 to her children’s nurse, $300 to another servant and most of her wealth and assets to husband John Mayer and their four children.
DEATH

Lillie fatally shot herself on the second story of the Birch Mansion at approximately 4 p.m. on Friday, July 13, 1900, according to testimony delivered at the subsequent inquest. She reportedly spent the early afternoon with her mother Emily and her visiting sister Theodora’s family at the Havemeyer House, her late father’s residence located approximately 1,000 feet from the Birch Mansion (the Havemeyer House now serves as home to the acting Ramapo College president). Theodora was pregnant and likely preparing to enter labor. Newspaper accounts of Lillie’s movements following her visit with family are based almost entirely upon the word of two people: Paige, the sole witness to Lillie’s shooting, and Lieutenant-Commander Cameron Winslow, Theodora’s husband and informal spokesman for the grieving family. Both testified at an inquest on July 16.

Lillie immediately ascended the stairs of the Birch Mansion upon her return from the Havemeyer House, according to Paige’s testimony as reported by The Evening World. She entered Paige’s office where her friend and secretary offered to read aloud from a book. He reportedly performed this service on a near-daily basis, but Lillie declined that afternoon. “I don’t care much for that book. I guess I’ll go to my own apartment and rest awhile,” she told Paige. They were alone on the second floor – John was away, attending a wedding in Newport, Rhode Island.

The Birch Mansion’s second story featured a relatively open floor plan in the summer of 1900. Curtains hung in the doorways, and when drawn aside, offered Paige a clear view of the rooms adjoining his office. The New York Times reported Paige watched as Lillie left his workplace, passed through a nursery and entered her “sleeping apartment.” From 25 feet away, Paige saw Lillie turn her back to him as she passed a small white desk set at the bedroom’s far end. He noticed “her hands were moving” but was unable to see more. As he watched, a shot rang out. Lillie collapsed upon her back, a bullet from the
revolver found beside her having passed through her chest and back. *The Chicago Tribune* would report
the “bit of lead” was later found in a corner of the bedroom. Paige ran to Lillie, kicking the firearm
beneath a table as he bent over her. “Oh, it hurts; I didn’t mean to do that!” she reportedly told Paige as he
called for help. A maid named Katie responded to Paige’s cries immediately. She had been working
downstairs but later testified she had not heard the fatal gunshot. They were soon joined by an
unnamed coachman who quickly left to fetch Dr. Albert Zabriskie, the Havemeyer family physician based
in Mahwah. The time was 4 p.m. He would reach the Birch Mansion an hour later.

Zabriskie was greeted by Commander Winslow upon his arrival to the Mayer family home. Winslow led
the doctor upstairs to the semi-conscious Lillie, who had not been moved from her position on the
bedroom floor. She was accompanied by Paige and Emily, who had arrived sometime in the interim.
“She was in very great pain,” Zabriskie later testified. “She seemed to be suffering so much that she did
not know what was going on around her.” He also addressed Paige and others’ failure to move Lillie to
the nearby bed, saying he believed they thought doing so would “complicate the wound.” Zabriskie
administered chloroform. The opiate appeared to ease Lillie’s pain, and she reportedly begged Zabriskie
for another dose. The appeal was her last; according to the doctor, Lillie did not speak again.

PAIGE RAN TO LILLIE, KICKING THE FIREARM BENEATH A TABLE AS HE BENT OVER HER.

Zabriskie was soon joined by Dr. Clement Cleveland, Theodora’s own physician, who was attending Mrs.
Winslow at the Havemeyer House when summoned. The two doctors agreed a surgeon would be
needed in the effort to save Lillie’s life, and sent a telegraph to a New York specialist, Dr. Frank Markoe,
requesting his aid. The surgeon arrived at midnight but believed it would be best to do nothing. Lillie
was in critical condition: The wound – although “a little larger than an ordinary lead pencil” – had
penetrated the intestines. The three doctors almost certainly knew their patient was doomed.

Lillie died at the age of 36 the following day, sometime in the afternoon, having received last rites from
a priest based in the neighboring town of Suffern, New York. John had returned early that morning. Any
interaction he may have had with his dying wife is unknown. Funeral services were on July 16. Theodora
gave birth that same day.
The surviving Havemeyer clan, led by Commander Winslow, attempted to hide the true nature of Lillie’s untimely death from the public. Winslow refused to comment when asked by a *New York Times* reporter for a cause of death. Family members told others Lillie had died of heart failure, claiming “she had not been in good health since the birth of her 6-months-old baby [Joseph].” The family also delayed contact with local authorities, notifying the coroner’s office only upon learning “the cause of Mrs. Mayer’s death was known to the public,” according to *The Chicago Tribune*. Winslow finally submitted a statement to the press on the night of Sunday, July 15, 1900, one full day after Lillie’s passing. The message was brief: “Mrs. Mayer died from the effects of a pistol shot accidentally fired. The wound was not at first believed to be fatal. The Coroner’s inquest will be held, in accordance with the law.” It’s likely the coroner – Dr. W. L. Vroom – learned of Lillie’s death mere hours before the statement’s release.
Dr. Vroom was called to the Birch Mansion approximately 44 hours after Lillie had fatally shot herself. Setting off from his home in nearby Ridgewood, he pulled up to the Havemeyer property on Sunday night and immediately began an inquiry. Dr. Vroom later complained of this delay, telling The New York Times “he was hampered in his work.” He terminated his investigation on Monday, July 16, less than 24 hours later. Lillie’s death had resulted from an accidental, self-inflicted gunshot wound, Dr. Vroom announced. Neither an inquest nor an autopsy would be necessary.

But Dr. Vroom’s declaration was misleading. He had held an inquest of sorts earlier that day. In a proceeding dubbed by The Evening World as a “secret” and “sort of informal inquest,” Dr. Vroom privately interrogated six witnesses: Paige, the secretary; Winslow, husband of Theodora; Katie, the maid; Lillie’s widower John; and Drs. Zabriskie and Cleveland. Transcripts of their testimony were kept from the press by Dr. Vroom, who claimed he could not provide copies “until after the witnesses’ statements had been filed with the County Clerk,” according to a story in The Richmond Dispatch originally published by The New York Herald. But Dr. Vroom had no qualms in describing his ersatz inquest to the press from memory. As a result, the testimony attributed to Paige and others by newspapers across the U.S. was recounted to reporters secondhand by Dr. Vroom.
CONFLICTING REPORTS

The essential circumstances of Lillie’s death are undisputed: A self-inflicted gunshot mortally wounded her on the second floor of the Birch Mansion. Clinton Paige was the sole witness to her shooting, after which Lillie fell into a semi-conscious state, asking only for morphine before dying the next day. Lillie’s state of mind, her visit to the Havemeyer House and the seeming unintentionality of her final act were debated by newspapers in the weeks following the tragedy. Some disparities in coverage may be attributed to the Havemeyers’ apparent disinformation campaign in the hours following Lillie’s death. Other incongruities are due to some newspapers’ tendency to bloat their copy with unsubstantiated rumor and hyperbole. The South Dakota-based Lead Daily Call was one such publication. When naming theories in the case, the Call offered the most obvious – “Mrs. Mayer committed suicide” – as well as another: Lillie “was murdered by a woman as the result of a quarrel.” No mention of this theory has been found elsewhere.

The Richmond Dispatch’s account of Paige’s testimony is markedly incompatible with versions issued by other newspapers. It claims Lillie repeatedly told Paige she felt “depressed” in the minutes prior to the shooting. The story also claims Dr. Vroom “knew Mrs. Mayer had been much depressed for some time – but why he could not say.” If Paige and Dr. Vroom indeed made these remarks no other newspaper saw fit to repeat them. Most publications exclusively refer to John and Winslow, both of whom asserted Lillie had been happy. The Evening World indicates Dr. Vroom said as much, as well. “I understand Mrs. Mayer was of a cheerful disposition, and can find no reason why she should have sought her own life,” the coroner reportedly said when announcing his decision to scrap an official inquest. The Havemeyer family physician, Dr. Albert Zabriskie, offered similar testimony in the same story. “Mrs. Mayer was a woman of the happiest disposition,” he said. “She was always happy. There was always a roguish smile on her face.”
SMOKING GUN

Lillie’s status as an outdoorswoman was unchallenged. She rode horseback on a near-daily basis. Hunting and target-shooting were among her favorite activities. *The New York Times* indicated Lillie “understood firearms thoroughly and was fairly expert with a rifle.” So, how did the accident occur? Winslow told reporters Lillie had been cleaning her revolver when the firearm discharged. Paige also elaborated upon his own testimony in the hours following the secret inquest. He claimed Lillie had cried, “I was looking at my pistol when it suddenly exploded.”

One *New York Times* article detailing the results of Dr. Vroom’s investigation includes a revelation not found elsewhere. If accurate, the information may discount the possibility of an accidental shooting.

A STRANGE CIRCUMSTANCE.

A peculiar circumstance is, however, that only three of the five chambers of the pistol had been loaded and the cartridge which was exploded was the last in the order in which the cylinder revolved. Had it missed fire it would have been necessary to have snapped the weapon twice before bringing another cartridge under the hammer.

It’s possible Lillie repeatedly pulled the trigger before a slug opened her chest.

THE MYSTERIOUS MR. PAIGE

Clifton H. Paige, longtime family friend and live-in employee of the Havemeyers, is an unknown quantity. The media failed to report on his life prior to Mountain Side Farm, despite Paige’s top billing in nearly all coverage of Lillie’s death. Only one story, published by *The New York Times*, mentions his past. It merely notes, “he came from Boston.” Paige’s name has proven to be a source of mystery as well. Newspapers chronically misspelled it, mistakenly rendering “Clifton H. Paige” as “Clinton H. Page” (an examination of Lillie’s will in fall 2018 revealed the discrepancy).

Paige first appeared on Mountain Side Farm in 1890. He was then a civil engineer and had been hired by Theodore Havemeyer to lay roads across the property. When the task was completed, Paige had befriended the Havemeyers and stayed on, becoming the Havemeyers’ chief bookkeeper. At some point he grew close to Lillie, joining her on horseback rides and reading to her in the afternoons. Their intimate relationship caught the attention of locals, and when Lillie died, the press happily regurgitated the rumors; gossip bloomed in America’s tabloids and broadsheets. According to one popular yet unsubstantiated claim, John Mayer and Lillie’s mother Emily “objected to the presence of one person in the household.” Paige is clearly the unnamed party. Commander Winslow railed against the implications. “It is foolish to say that Mrs. Mayer had other than a friendly regard for Mr. Page (sic) or he for her,” he told *The Evening World*. “Mr. Mayer is an exceptionally handsome man and possessed the full love of his wife.”
Paige’s ultimate fate is unknown. Commander Winslow and John Mayer assured reporters Paige would remain employed at Mountain Side Farm, but due to an absence of documentation, this cannot be confirmed. He was last seen by reporters on the morning of July 17, 1900, one day after the secret inquest. They quizzed Paige as he boarded a train bound for New York City. “His face was very pale,” The Richmond Dispatch reported, “and his lower lip quivered as he spoke.”

HE WAS LAST SEEN BY REPORTERS ON THE MORNING OF JULY 17, 1900.

Ongoing research into Paige’s life prior to Mountain Side Farm has yielded promising results. Paige may be linked to a series of expeditions in the Yucatán Peninsula of Mexico led by archaeologist and diplomat Edward Herbert Thompson. These excursions were sponsored by the Peabody Museum of Harvard University, an institution effectively next door to Paige’s reported hometown of Boston. In a memoir of the expedition, Thompson counted a Boston-based civil engineer named Clifton H. Paige among his crew. If the two Paiges are one and the same, the man in the accompanying photograph is the sole witness to the shooting of Lillie Mayer. His disappearance locked away the secret of her death forever.
LILLIE’S LEGACY

Today, Lillie Mayer’s life is defined by its violent end, and her story has been forgotten by those who live and work on the land once known as Mountain Side Farm. But still she persists, moving through the years in a ghost story told by students at the smallest public college in New Jersey. We’ll never know if her death was intentional. A complete portrait of her character will never be painted. But we can always pass the Birch Mansion and glance back at the second-story window. Perhaps, if we’re lucky, Lillie will be there.
This story is based on research conducted with the help of the following institutions:

- George T. Potter Library Archives, Ramapo College of New Jersey
Books referenced in "Mystery in the Mansion":


All news sources cited in this story, with the exception of "Birch Mansion Mystery Continues," were retrieved from newspapers.com:

- “A Tragic Record: The Havemeyers and Their Chapter of Sorrows.” *The Lead Daily Call*, 15 Sept. 1900.


- “Black Hand of Fate.” *The Inter-Ocean*, 29 July 1900.


Clifton Paige’s 1894 U.S. passport application and Lillie Mayer’s will were retrieved from ancestry.com.